*****DRAFT MINUTES*****

Alexandria Board of Architectural Review Old & Historic Alexandria District

Wednesday, April 4, 2012

7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall 301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Tom Hulfish, Chairman

Chip Carlin Oscar Fitzgerald Wayne Neale John von Senden Peter Smeallie

Members Absent: Art Keleher

Staff Present: Planning & Zoning

Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner

The meeting was called to order at 7:32 p.m. by Chairman Hulfish.

I. MINUTES

1. Consideration of the <u>minutes</u> of the public hearing of March 21, 2012. BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as submitted, 6-0.**

On a motion by Dr. Fitzgerald, seconded by Mr. von Senden, the minutes were approved, as submitted, 6-0.

II. DISCUSSION ITEMS

1. CASE BAR2011-0365

Request for alterations at 815 ½ King St, zoned KR King Street Retail

APPLICANT: 815 1/2 King Street, LLC

BOARD ACTION: The Board approved the application, as amended, 5-0-1.

(Chairman Hulfish recused himself from the case)

CONDITIONS:

- 1. That this application serves as a sign master plan but that the future tenant submit an application before the BAR for final sign details;
- 2. That Staff approve the mortar and brick color and texture for any area requiring infill;
- 3. That if replacement windows are necessary on the front or rear elevation, that they

- be in conformance with the Board's adopted Window Policy; and
- 4. That the applicant recreates the three finials and bracket molding at the roof parapet, shown in the original photographs, as part of the façade restoration.

SPEAKERS

Rob Kaufman, owner of 815 ½ King St, spoke on behalf of the application. Mr. Kaufman summarized the changes to the project scope and noted that he is trying to find a theatre use for the building.

John Hynan, representing the Historic Alexandria Foundation (HAF), explained that HAF advocates for the preservation of buildings as they were originally constructed, but secondarily supports the preservation of buildings which contain features and materials which have themselves attained historic significance over time. He explained that the Foundation favored the current application which preserves the 1914 building with the marquee alterations, without reference to its future use.

Boyd Walker, owner of 818 King Street, noted his support for the project.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Neale commenced the Board's discussion by expressing that he was extremely happy that the owner is searching for a theatre tenant for the building. He noted that the design was simple and allows for the building's original form to come through.

Mr. Smeallie questioned the retention of the marquee if the building is not utilized as a theatre. Staff explained that the marquee would remain on the building even if the building did not contain a theatre use, similar to the former J.C. Penny's, now Ross Dress for Less. Staff stated that the proposed backlit plastic box signs, historically used for movie announcements, would not be supported by the Design Guidelines if the ultimate use is retail. In any event, the final sign package would need to be reviewed and approved by the BAR prior to installation.

Mr. von Senden noted his strong support of the project but expressed his preference that the box office to be centered on the façade, if possible.

Mr. Carlin commended that applicant for listening to the community's concerns regarding the building use and preservation of the Old Town sign and marquee and conveyed his support for the design.

Dr. Fitzgerald noted that he favored the original proposal but expressed his support for the current proposal, as well.

On a motion by Mr. von Senden, seconded by Mr. Smeallie, the Board approved the application, as amended, 5-0-1 (Chairman Hulfish recused himself from the case.)

REASON

The Board found the proposed alterations to be consistent with the BAR's *Design Guidelines* as well as the King Street Retail Strategy *Storefront Design Guidelines*.

2. CASE BAR2012-0014

Request for demolition/encapsulation at **212 S Alfred St**, zoned RM Residential <u>APPLICANT</u>: Rahmi Hakan Ozsancak by Stephanie Dimond

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, by a roll call vote, 6-0.

<u>CONDITION</u>: The applicant will submit materials showing how the required parking space will be delineated from the open space prior to issuance of demolition or building permits.

SPEAKERS

Stephanie Dimond, architect, spoke on behalf of the application.

BOARD DISCUSSION

After determining the Board did not need to discuss the subject case, Mr. von Senden made a motion to approve the case, as amended, seconded by Mr. Neale. The Board approved the application, by roll call vote, 6-0.

REASON

The Board found that the existing 20th century garage had been substantially altered over time and was not of old and unusual or uncommon design, texture or material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty and granted the Permit to Demolish.

3. CASE BAR2012-0053

Request for demolition/encapsulation at **103 Franklin St**, zoned RM Residential <u>APPLICANT</u>: Caroline & Timothy Hanson by Stephen Kulinski, A.I.A. BOARD ACTION: **Approved as amended, by a roll call vote, 6-0.**

See Item #4 for discussion of this case.

4. CASE BAR2012-0056

Request for alterations at 103 Franklin St, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Caroline & Timothy Hanson by Stephen Kulinski, A.I.A.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, by a roll call vote, 6-0.

<u>CONDITION</u>: That the new windows will be in conformance with the Window Policy.

SPEAKERS

Stephen Kulinski, architect, spoke on behalf of the application.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. von Senden, Dr. Fitzgerald supported the application.

Mr. Neale questioned the dormer window trim detail, which was clarified by Mr. Kulinski.

On a motion by Mr. von Senden and a second by Mr. Neale, the Board approved the application, as amended, by roll call vote, 6-0.

REASON

The Board found the proposed dormer additions compatible with the existing, 1970s townhouse and its immediate context.

III. OTHER BUSINESS

1. Beachcomber – 0 Prince Street

<u>BOARD ACTION</u>: **The Board found this building to be historically significant, 6-0.** On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Mr. von Senden, the Board found the building to be culturally significant by a vote of 6-0.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Staff made a brief presentation to explain the purpose of the request for a finding of significance for the former Beachcombers Restaurant building, now owned by the City, in preparation for a Request for Proposal for lease and renovation, as recommended in the Waterfront Master Plan.

Chairman Hulfish stated that this was the only building left from this period, except for the Old Dominion Boat Club, and that it should be saved.

Mr. Neale agreed, noting that it should be preserved for its cultural, rather than architectural significance.

Mr. Carlin echoed Chairman Hulfish, stating that the building should be retained and integrated into the surround parks.

Jeremy McPike, Director of General Services explained that an RFP would be developed this summer for a tenant for this City building but that this work would have to be coordinated with surrounding infrastructure engineering, flood mitigation and park designs. He also cautioned that, although preliminary studies indicated the building was generally sound, additional structural analysis would be needed to evaluate the condition of the foundation piles and obvious cracks in the concrete block walls, as well as the deteriorated balconies and roof. Staff emphasized that alterations would be required for the building to comply with current building code and the future tenants program but that every effort would be made to preserve the overall character of the original waterfront restaurant.

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Mr. von Senden, the Board found the building to be culturally significant by a vote of 6-0.

FINDING

The Board found the building to be historically significant under criteria #1, #5 and #6 of zoning ordinance section 10-105(B). The Board emphasized that it was the general architectural character of the building that conveyed its cultural significance as an early public recreational use on the Alexandria waterfront and not the specific materials or design of the structure.

2. Old Alexandria Health Department building – 509-517 N Saint Asaph St BOARD ACTION: The Board deferred this item for further study, 6-0.

Staff made a brief presentation to explain the purpose of the request for a finding of significance for the former City Health Department building, in preparation for a Request for Proposal for disposal of the site as surplus property.

The Board expressed strong interest in the building but, due to the late delivery of the Staff memo and the importance of the request, asked Staff to schedule a brief work session on site immediately prior to the next regularly scheduled Board meeting on April 18, 2012 to inspect the architectural features and neighborhood context in more detail.

The Board deferred this item for further study, 6-0.

IV. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

The following items are shown for information only. Based on the Board's adopted policies, these cases have been approved by Staff since the previous Board meeting.

CASE BAR2012-0067

Request for signage and door replacement at **111 S Alfred St**, zoned CD Commercial APPLICANT: Iris Armaou

CASE BAR2012-0069

Request for roof replacement at **105 Prince St**, zoned RM Residential <u>APPLICANT</u>: Delaney Realty

CASE BAR2012-0074

Request for window repair/replacement at **333 Green St**, zoned RM Residential <u>APPLICANT:</u> Amy and Paul O'Sullivan

CASE BAR2012-0075

Request for siding replacement at **604 S Fairfax St**, zoned RM Residential <u>APPLICANT:</u> Michael Dyke

CASE BAR2012-0076

Request for signage at $1426\ Prince\ St$, zoned CD Commercial

APPLICANT: Sharla Abel

CASE BAR2012-0078

Request for tuck pointing (repair) at **1223 Prince St**, zoned CL Commercial <u>APPLICANT</u>: Joseph Collum

CASE BAR2012-0079

Request for window replacement at **1250 S Washington St #602**, zoned RC Residential <u>APPLICANT:</u> Frank Coletti and Carman Harbison by Reamco, Inc.

CASE BAR2012-0080

Request for rear fence at **510 S Fairfax St**, zoned RM Residential <u>APPLICANT</u>: Robert Bentley Adams

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Hulfish adjourned the meeting at approximately 8:35pm.

Minutes submitted by,

Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner Boards of Architectural Review